

Ezra Jack Keats Bookmaking Competition Judging Protocol



Preliminary Information:

- All books being considered by this jury have been selected as the School-Wide winner of the school it represents.
- The Jury consists of nine judges and the deliberations are conducted in two rounds, Round One and Round Two.
- The winning and honorable mention books are chosen in Round Two.
- The books are divided into three groups by Grade Level: 3-5, 6-8, 9-12.
- Books are evaluated within the context of their Grade Level group.
- The Criteria for judging is attached
- There will be one City winner on each Grade Level, five Borough winners on each Grade Level and up to nine Honorable Mentions on each Grade Level.
- It is not necessary to have a winner in every borough.

Voting Method:

1. For Round One the nine judges will be divided equally among three tables.
2. The books will be evaluated one Grade Level at a time.
3. For Round Two all judges will sit together to review the books advanced from Round One.
4. Judges read each book presented and vote *Yes*, *No* or *Maybe* on a post-it note affixed to the cover. Books that have two “No’s” are eliminated, except when a judge argues strongly in its favor.
5. A new post-it is used on the book cover to record the results of the each vote.
6. In each Round, in each level, a judge may argue in favor of only one book that has received two “No’s”. If the other judges agree, the book can be reconsidered in the next vote. If the other judges are not convinced, the book is removed from consideration.
7. Books that have been eliminated from discussion can still be considered for Honorable Mention if three judges agree it should be considered.

Round One:

1. In Round One, each table will consider one-third of the books submitted at each Grade Level.
 - GOAL: To eliminate unlikely contenders and provide the most time in Round Two for the discussion of books most likely to be chosen as winners and honorees.

2. In Round One, the number of books chosen from each Grade Level to advance to Round Two, should be no fewer than 3 and no more than 5.

GOAL: Each table will advance between 3 to 5 books, at each Grade Level, to Round Two.

Contingency plan:

- a. If a table cannot fill its quota of books to advance to the final round, the coordinator should be informed. If possible, the other tables can fill those vacancies and try to meet the minimum number of books required for Round Two.
- b. If a Grade Level has fewer than 10 school-wide winners submitted for consideration, Round One can be skipped for that Grade Level and all the books submitted will be advanced to Round Two.

Round Two

1. All the judges gather at one table to consider all the books advanced from Round One.
2. Books are eliminated until there are six finalists at each Grade Level.
3. City-Wide and the Borough winners are chosen from the six finalists at each Level.
4. Up to 27 Honorable Mentions can be chosen from the remaining group of books.
 - GOAL: One City-Wide winner on each Grade Level

Five Borough winners on each Grade Level

Up to nine Honorable Mentions on each Grade Level.

Honorable Mentions:

1. There will be a maximum of 27 books allowed for Honorable Mention each year, nine books at each level.
2. There will be no minimum number of Honorable Mentions needed to advance to the final round.

Contingency plan:

- a. If fewer than the minimum number of books at any level are advanced to Round Two, the City and Borough winners will be chosen from that group.
- b. If fewer books on any Grade Level are advanced for Round Two than are needed to fill the one City and five Borough winner positions, the jury can decide to have fewer winners, or to reconsider a book that was eliminated during Round One. In this case, one book from each table can be re-considered for submission to the final round. At least two judges from each table must agree on the book to be re-considered.

Post-Deliberations:

- The results are reported to the educators after Winter Break. The educators will deliver the news to the students.
- Every student who has completed a book for the Competition receives a Certificate of Commendation.
- Every School-Wide winner receives a medal and a Certificate of Commendation.
- All participating educators receive a Certificate of Commendation
- Honorable Mention students receive a medal, a Certificate, attend the award ceremony, receive a goody bag filled with books.*
- Borough Winners receive a medal, a Certificate, attend the award ceremony, receive a goody bag*, receive a check for \$100.
- City Winners receive a medal, a Certificate, attend the award ceremony, receive a goody bag*, receive a check for \$500.
- Educators of City and Borough winners and Honorable Mentions attend ceremony, receive a Certificate, receive a goody bag.*
- All City and Borough winning books will be pictured in the annual catalog.
- Honorable Mentions and School-Wide winners will be listed in the annual catalog.
- City and Borough winners, Honorable Mentions and a select number of School-Wide winners will be part of the EJK Bookmaking Competition Exhibition in the Youth Wing of the Central Branch of Brooklyn Public Library.

*The goody bags and books for the students and educators are generously donated by Penguin Random House.